

Education for Sustainable Development
– the CART requirements

Guidance for Associate Deans, Subject
or Programme Leaders, Course Teams,
Chairs of CART, Academic Support
Advisers and CART members.

Academic Session 2009/10

University of Bradford
V1.1

Introduction

This document provides updated guidance on the institutional ESD requirement for new courses and courses subject to Periodic Review from September 2008 (see www.bradford.ac.uk/ecoversity/esd for original CART guidance and forms).

This guidance highlights some key points about the process, seeks to share good practice and lessons learnt and support delivery of the University Corporate Strategy values and strategic aims notably,

Core value: **Sustainable** - seek to be world-class and embed sustainable development and practice in everything we do.

Corporate strategic aim (Aim 1 C1): By delivering a first class learning experience within an inspiring physical, intellectual and virtual environment which is underpinned by the concepts and practice of diversity, employability, enterprise and sustainable development across the curricula;

The guidance provides extracts and examples from recent practice to illustrate approaches and provide help in subsequent course review.

A background to the evolution of the ESD requirement within the Corporate Strategy and CART is summarised in appendix 3.

If you would like to share positive examples, progress, lessons or tips then please get in touch.

*Dr Peter Hopkinson
Director of ESD, Ecoversity
September 2009*

Guidance to support the achievement of the Education for Sustainable Development requirement for CART by Academic Schools

What are the essential requirements for ESD to be addressed by a School and CART ?

The essential requirements for CART are:

In the case of new programmes

1. Has a School articulated ESD (see examples below) and is this cross referenced to the ESD Action Plans and School Plans ?
2. Where will a student on a programme receive learning opportunities around ESD ?
3. Has the School produced a statement on how students will be informed about the ESD commitment and learning opportunities within the curriculum ?

In the case of Periodic Review

1. Has the School acknowledged the issue of ESD in its review ?
2. Has the School highlighted its existing articulation and justification of ESD (see examples below) ?
3. Has the School provided an action plan to indicate how it will articulate, progress and develop/enhance ESD learning opportunities for all students ?
4. Has the School produced a statement on how students will be informed about the ESD commitment and learning opportunities within the curriculum ?

What if a new course or Periodic Review doesn't conform to the requirements?

Documentation for a new course or Periodic Review should not be submitted unless it meets the CART ESD requirements.

Before recommending a detailed new course proposal to a CART, a School Board (or School Learning and Teaching Committee with delegated authority) should have considered in detail the content and structure of the course. The Programme Specification and module descriptors play a key role in this consideration as the School Board seeks to assure itself of the quality of the existing, and new course, provision it wishes to offer.

Documents to be submitted in preparation for Periodic Review must first be considered by the Associate Dean, Learning and Teaching. They may be

referred to a School committee if s/he identifies issues that call for wider consideration.

In both cases it is therefore the responsibility of the School to ensure that documentation for a new course or for Periodic Review meets the ESD requirements above. The checklist for new courses and Periodic Review includes the requirements for ESD. The checklist is signed off by Dean/Associate Deans hence no course or documentation should be forwarded by a school to CART without confirmation that the ESD requirement has been addressed.

The checklist should then be appended to the documents submitted to the appropriate CART. The checklist has been designed to assist CART members in their deliberations by clearly demonstrating that the School Board has considered the relevant areas.

What is the end point in the CART process i.e when is the ESD requirement satisfied?

The evidence required to show the ESD requirement has been satisfied is through the Programme Specification, module outlines (where appropriate) in addition to the documentation to be included in student handbooks (to communicate to students how and where ESD is addressed at School level and course level).

A CART Chair should not make a recommendation for approval unless the ESD requirement is satisfied.

What role does an Academic Pioneer play in the process?

Each School has, since September 2007, seconded an ESD Academic Pioneer (typically 1 day a week), funded through the Ecovercity StuDent project (see list in appendix). The ESD Pioneers are key resources and sources of expertise on ESD within their School. It is expected that Course Teams/leaders would consult with the ESD Pioneer prior to the submission of new course or Periodic Review documentation.

What role does the Associate Dean play in the process ?

The role of the Associate Dean will vary from School to School but as the overseer of School level CART activity it is expected that the Associate Dean would work closely with their ESD Pioneer to offer guidance on the process, articulation and evidencing of ESD within a specific course.

What role does the Director of ESD play in the process ?

The Director of ESD is available to offer strategic advice and support for Pioneers or any School or CART Chair. The Director receives CART documentation relevant to ESD and through the Sustainable Education Directorate is conducting an on-going monitoring of outcomes and effectiveness of the process. The Directorate reports findings and key lessons to the ESD Task Group chaired by the DVC (Academic), to the University Learning and Teaching committee as well as progress to HEFCE as part of the Strategic Development Fund (SDF) project Ecoversity StuDent.

What is the role of the Academic Support Advisor ?

The ASA's primary role in relation to ESD is to advise and guide the School on the University's requirements when preparing documents, and to notify them of any conditions or recommendations arising from CART meetings. As with other CART conditions and recommendations, the ASA will forward revised course documents to the Chair of CART and discuss any outstanding matters with the Chair and the School if necessary.

What is the role of the CART chair?

The CART Chair should direct the CART panel to review the ESD Programme requirements against the formal requirements and assess whether the School has fulfilled its requirements.

This assessment will be based on:

The checklist, has the ESD requirement been confirmed and signed off by the School ?

The provision of a Programme Specification and associated documentation to students that sets out how the ESD requirements have been met.

A Chair of CART should not approve a new course or sign off course approval without this evidence. In this instance a condition will be placed on the Course Team with a deadline to satisfy the requirement.

Until the condition is satisfied a course does not have approval to run

Are there any resources or examples that I can look at as guidance?

A formal evaluation of the first year of the requirements has been conducted and the following examples are drawn from course documentation from the Schools, new courses and Periodic Review documentation, and may be useful in supporting course teams and Schools in fulfilling their duties.

Examples of School level statements addressing Education for Sustainable development

1. Life Sciences

School of Life Sciences (Draft Sep 2009): Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) - Statement for the School of Life Sciences

Sustainable development presents major challenges to society, which need to be embraced by the School of Life Sciences. The University is committed to providing Education for Sustainable Development within all its Programmes.

In line with this the School of Life Sciences seeks to provide opportunities for students and staff to acquire the knowledge, understanding and skills necessary for sustainable development practices.

The School will ensure that curricula reflect the integration of practice through personal and social understanding of responsible and ethical behaviour (attitudes and values) aligned with that of 'Responsible Science' and where appropriate 'Responsible Professionalism'. This will be achieved through evidence based approaches.

In line with the Institutional ethos of ESD, the School will also provide opportunities for dialogue and sharing of information about successes, where appropriate areas for development will be identified and shared. Core to this is the recognition of accountability for the responsible use of sound science, the sustainable use of resource and the achievement of social justice.

School of Life Sciences - Programme Specification Statement (Draft Sept 2009) Education for Sustainable Development (ESD)

The University of Bradford and the School of Life Sciences are committed to the principles of Education for Sustainable Development as outlined in the UNESCO definition (see <http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php>).

[Each programme team to include sentence about how these principles relate to individual programme and teaching, learning and assessment strategies. For example; opportunities to develop critical thinking and problem solving skills that explore the sustainable development challenge related to Responsible Science or Responsible Professionalism].

[Each programme to give an example of modules in which key issues or themes of ESD are explored through content and teaching method. For example; Modules X, Y,Z will debate utilisation of the Principles of Responsible Science, using case based teaching approaches that examine the dilemmas and challenges of sustainable development].

***Student Communication via handbook - Example from Course
Director Helen Cook MSc Clinical Pharmacy (Community)***



Ecoversity and Education for Sustainable Development

Sustainable development means taking action to protect the planet for the sake of future generations. Ecoversity is the name given to the University's programme of commitment to sustainable development (www.brad.ac.uk/ecoversity). The programme has three significant elements:

- 1) Make the campus and the University a greener, healthier and safer environment for students, staff and our surrounding communities.
- 2) Provide academic programmes that contain some element of education for sustainable development in ways that are relevant and appropriate to the course of study (see below).
- 3) Create opportunities for students to get involved in the development of Ecoversity and make a contribution to sustainable development. If you would like to know more about this, please [click on this link](#) or email Ecoversity@bradford.ac.uk.

The University of Bradford and the School of Life Sciences are committed to the principles of Education for Sustainable Development as outlined in the UNESCO definition (see <http://www.unesco.org/en/esd>). Within the Bradford School of Pharmacy, these principles relate to educational programmes and teaching and learning strategies. This course will provide opportunities to develop critical thinking and problem solving skills that explore the sustainable development challenge related to 'responsible professionalism'.

The DoH White Paper 'Pharmacy in England. Building on strengths - delivering the future' (April 2008) highlights the importance of enhancing pharmacy's contribution to health and promotion of its potential to lead local communities. It states that 'The Public Health Leadership Forum for Pharmacy.....will identify a programme for 2008-2010 to accelerate pharmacy's ongoing and expanding contribution to health, how it contributes to reducing health inequalities and with a particular focus on community leadership and sustainable development'.

The article 'Help the public and the planet by engaging in sustainable development' ([The Pharmaceutical Journal 2008; 281: 596](#)) outlines for pharmacists the link between health improvement and sustainable development. For sustainable development to be effective it requires everyone to think 'greener' and requires a range of activities at different levels. Due to their varied locations and accessible nature, community pharmacies are ideally placed to contribute to local health improvement and reduce the impact of health inequalities. They are a key resource for the promotion of health, social-inclusion and well-being.

As you work through each of the modules on this course, we would like you to consider how your role as a pharmacist in providing health advice to current generations can impact on sustainable development and so improve the health of future generations. [PharmacyHealthLink](#) has produced a range of resources to provide pharmacists and their staff with background information to help them to lead by example. These resources examine key influences associated with sustainable development and its potential impact on health.

- ['Towards a Healthier Planet'](#) - a background guide to sustainable development
- ['Our Planet'](#) - a pharmacy-focused resource with helpful tips and further contacts
- ['Healthy You - Healthy Planet'](#) - a patient information leaflet.

2. School of Lifelong Education and Development

Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) statement for inclusion in SLED TLA Strategy.

Education is the primary agent of transformation towards sustainable development, increasing people's capacities to transform their visions for Society into reality. Education for Sustainable Development teaches individuals how to make decisions that consider the long-term future of the economy, ecology and equity of all communities (UNESCO, 2008).

The UNESCO ESD definition reflects four main areas: social and economic justice, cultural diversity, human rights of future generations and the protection and restoration of the Earth's ecosystems. The School aims to incorporate these principles through its curricula and methods of delivery, thus enabling students to become empowered, independent, proactive learners.

The School of Lifelong Education and Development provides a unique route into the University of Bradford through a range of innovative programmes, including Foundation Years, Foundation Degrees and other Undergraduate and Masters

Programmes. The School is constantly seeking to improve its access and flexibility of delivery, through campus and community taught modules. On completion of their programme of study students will have developed an understanding of:

- The relationship between ESD, academic study and professional practice
- The inequalities, diversity and social justice in contemporary societies
- How reflection and critical thinking inform change and practice
- How their learning could impact upon local, community and national issues
- The need to balance economic, social and environmental issues in public policy

Students will have gained this understanding through taught modules which reflect elements of the UNESCO definition of ESD as well as specific modules in 'Principles of Sustainable Development' and 'Thinking for Sustainable Development'. Alongside the taught curricula, the School also aims to support ESD principles through its student support, personal tutors, retention activities and its University-wide role in Widening Participation and Community Engagement.

Reference

UNESCO (2004) Education for Sustainable Development Information Brief [online] United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation available from: http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=30373&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html [accessed 27/4/09}

3. School of Health studies

Statement on Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) within the School of Health Studies

Education for all healthcare professionals is central to meeting local and national agendas. Of key importance to these are the promotion of health and well-being, improving quality of life and placing patients and their families (service users) as active participants in their own care and as key contributors to the design of new improved and personalised services (DH, 2008a, 2008b, 2008c, 2005, 2004, HEFCE 2009,2005, HSE, 2008).

Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) within healthcare aims to value and build on achievements in teaching, curricula design and research whilst

developing new and creative approaches across disciplinary boundaries to address issues such as poverty, lifestyle, morbidity and mortality which have major implications for health.

Sustainability will evolve through the development and support of staff and students to make informed decisions and to take responsibility for the economic, environmental and social impact they have on their future professional and personal lives (DH 2009, 2008a, HEFCE 2009, 2005, UNESCO, 2008). To cultivate students into healthcare practitioners who can work and live sustainably we need to develop curricula which will facilitate each student's ability to:

- demonstrate respect and understanding of the different cultural, socioeconomic needs of their patients and client groups to support a strong, healthy and fair society.
- understand and embrace interprofessional and multidisciplinary team working as well as service user involvement to promote the sharing of knowledge and also fair and good governance within healthcare in addition to the local community.
- think critically; problem solve and inform their practice by using sound evidence and science responsibly.
- develop new ways of delivering health care to sustain locally relevant health services and seamless care by working and living within environmental limits whilst promoting a sustainable economy for the future
- promote the importance of health and wellbeing by improving personal as well as community awareness and to develop personal responsibility as well as contribute to a sustainable workforce
- have a solid foundation, based on shared competences highlighted in the Knowledge and Skills Framework to support the development of new roles and services for the future of health care provision.

Our students will gain an understanding of these principles through their interaction with teaching and learning across all modules in the School. It is expected that students will develop this knowledge further through their engagement with service users in the wider community, whilst on clinical placements in NHS settings and within current and developing collaborative placements in the voluntary and community sectors.

What does it mean for you as a student?

ESD aims to help you to understand the world you live in and take some responsibility for creating a sustainable future at home and at work.

ESD aims to encourage you to think about how your professional and your social lives might impact on problems such as poverty, waste, environmental damage, urban decay, population growth, health, conflict and human rights. Health care is traditionally resource intensive - its throw away culture supported by the need to prevent cross infection etc. However, we need to think about new ways of working to make sure we have the resources to maintain health care provision for future generations.

Ill health gets in the way of communities developing. Obesity, disease, substance abuse, unplanned pregnancy, and sexually transmitted infections are just some of the problems that have an impact on communities locally and internationally. In the UK the Government wants everyone to be more responsible for their own physical and mental health and well-being by making simple changes to their lives and taking responsibility for their own care. This has implications for those of us working in Health and Social Care. We need to move from trying to make people better to helping and encouraging them to live healthier lifestyles, staying healthy enough to work and live longer independent lives. This means as well as treating 'ill' people we need to learn how to educate and encourage people to stay well for example; by taking more exercise, eating sensibly and learning how to deal with stress. Health Care students will need to learn how to put patients at the heart of any management programme; learn to think critically about what they do when treating people and adopt a team (interprofessional) approach to treating patients.

We hope you will develop all these skills through the teaching and learning in your course specific modules and through working with your patients whilst on clinical practice in the NHS and voluntary and community sectors

4. School of Social and International Studies

Example of how ESD presented in Programme Specification following Periodic Review

Psychology

The University of Bradford, and the School of Social and International Studies (SSIS), are committed to the principles of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) set out in UNESCO's definition (see http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php-URL_ID=23279&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html), which include: interdisciplinarity; value-driven; critical thinking and problem solving; participatory decision-making; and applied learning which is relevant and culturally appropriate to local and other contexts. In your Programme you will find these principles underlie the teaching learning and assessment strategies. ESD is integrated within the Programme Aims enabling you to develop specific skills while also gaining a broad understanding of

how values such as equality and respect are mobilised within the discipline of Psychology. In addition there are modules in which the themes and issues of ESD are particularly explored, such as: SS-2408M, Personality and Individual Differences where you will consider a range of theoretical explanations for difference and diversity; examining how these both contribute to and come into conflict with the values that underlie ESD. You will be expected to think critically about the opportunities and possibilities for bringing about behaviour change. As part of your research methods training on SS-2402L, Research Methods in Psychology you will also need to think carefully about the ethical undertaking of research, working with others to negotiate and appropriately resolve problems that inevitably arise when undertaking research with human participants. We are also committed in SSIS to giving you opportunities to engage in debates about the meaning and future of Sustainable Development, as well as in the practice of ESD, for example, through volunteering on and off campus, by taking action in a series of activities as a School.

Full Programme Specification available at

[http://www.brad.ac.uk/admin/acsec/ProgSpec/entry2009/index.htm#Centre for Psychology Studies](http://www.brad.ac.uk/admin/acsec/ProgSpec/entry2009/index.htm#Centre_for_Psychology_Studies)

Appendix 1

Periodic Review - School confirmation

Documents to be submitted in preparation for Periodic Review must first be considered by the Associate Dean, Learning and Teaching. They may be referred to a School Committee if s/he identifies issues that call for wider consideration.

This cover sheet must be completed and sent to the Academic Standards Adviser with the final versions of the review documents to confirm that they have been seen by Associate Dean, Learning and Teaching and approved by the Dean, or her/his nominee.

A list of the documents required for Periodic Review is provided in the checklist that can be found at

(see ASSU website for template)

New course approval – School confirmation

(see ASSU website for template)

Appendix 2: List of Pioneers by School

School of Health Studies

Anita Saergant and Hilary Pape

School of Life Sciences

Bev Lucas, Liz Kelly and Tasmin Munshi

School of Social and International Studies

Rhys Kelly

School of Engineering Design and Technology

Currently unfilled.

School of Management

Jenny Fairbrass and Kyoko Fukukawa

School of Life Long Learning and Educational Development

Helen Turner Desai

School of Computing, Infomatics and Media

Dave Robison

Appendix 3

Background and Key Points.

The requirement for course approval and review to take ESD into account is relatively new (Sept 2008) and staff may be unfamiliar with the evolution of how and why ESD is now a strategic aim within the Corporate Strategy. This short section provides a quick update on the background' and summarises some key points from the first year of implementing ESD within new courses and Periodic Review.

a) The commitment to Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) at Bradford has been progressed through a series of actions over the past 3 years:

- ESD was included as one of the core elements of Ecoversity when it was launched in 2005, with the aspiration to promote learning about, and for, Sustainable Development as part of the fundamental Bradford student experience.
- An academic policy paper was presented at APC in February 2007 setting out the vision, philosophy and principles of how to set about achieving the Ecoversity ESD vision (www.brad.ac.uk/ecoversity)
- The University was awarded its first ever Strategic Development Fund grant by HEFCE in May 2007. This project, Ecoversity StuDent, set out an implementation strategy for embedding ESD in the formal curriculum through a combination of funded curriculum change actions (Pioneers, ESD Action Plans) and measures including the CART process.
- Between Sept 2007 and January 2008, Deans appointed Academic Pioneers (0.2) from existing staff in each Academic School. These Pioneers are funded from the Ecoversity StuDent project through to July 2010 to undertake ESD curriculum review, develop ESD Action Plans and take forward ESD in the curriculum within their respective Schools. Each Pioneer/School was permitted flexibility in how this could best be achieved for the School in relation to its specific academic context and conditions.
- APC formally approved a paper in June 2008 which set out the formal requirement for embedding ESD in courses at the point of new course development or Periodic Review (www.brad.ac.uk/ecoversity).
- The work of the Pioneers carried out in the first 12 months of the project was intended to underpin the articulation and detail required under CART.

- The academic session 2008/9 has seen the first year of the new ESD requirements in operation.

b) ESD at Bradford is built on the UNESCO ESD definition which is a broad framework (appendix 1). This framework emphasises that ESD is more than just greening or environmental management and encompasses social, ethical, economic and cultural values. It also stresses the importance of critical thinking, inter-disciplinary, multi-method approaches to assessment and challenging approaches to, and ideas about, teaching and learning. The breadth of the UNESCO framework means that there are many different ways a Course Team can engage with ESD, for example, focussing on aspects that have the best fit for the programmes of study, therefore it is appropriate that each course team may emphasise different elements. It has never been the intention that a course would cover *all* elements of ESD or the UNESCO framework- (unless it was felt to be appropriate to the subject or discipline). In other words, ***each Course Team will interpret the framework and translate it into real ESD content to reflect their local context and conditions.***

c) During the past 12 months the University has developed a new Corporate Strategy (2009-2014) in which the University has declared its commitment to Ecoversity and ESD for the next 5 year period. ESD is therefore a Corporate strategic aim (Aim 1 C1)

Feedback and review

d) Interviews with 28 staff involved in the new ESD requirements over the past 12 months has produced a diversity of comment about the ESD requirement and CART. Some have queried the appropriateness of CART as a mechanism for curriculum development and enhancement, the status and role of the Academic Pioneer within the School CART process and issues relating to the CART and how to know if the ESD requirement has been met.

In relation to ESD, the relationship between Academic Pioneers, School and CART was designed as follows:

- School level engagement with ESD was designed to be a bottom up process, beginning with the review carried out by the Pioneer. The review was a first step in stimulating a School-wide response to ESD, leading to a strategically planned, forward engagement with ESD embedded within a School action plan.
- In this way the course reviews undertaken form the foundation for course teams to develop a course specific response to ESD for the CART process.

- CART is the end point of a process to confirm that a course team has responded to an institutional objective, not a policing mechanism setting quality standards or criteria. In hindsight however it is evident (as indicated from a number of comments from academic Schools) that CART is often viewed as an unwelcome burden and policing mechanism.
- The core of the ESD CART requirement is to confirm that ESD is articulated at the programme level which should then be evidenced within a revised Programme Specification and through a student handbook.
- All detailed negotiation to determine what that ESD content should look like should have already taken place at School level within the usual School mechanisms prior to CART.

e) The extent to which the Schools have been able to develop their articulation of ESD in time for the academic session 08/09 varied from School to School. The extent to which Pioneer curriculum review and Action Plans were integrated into School-wide processes for teaching and learning also varied. Where the pre-CART School process has not been inclusive of, or engaged with, Pioneer activity this has led, in some instances, to course documentation being submitted to CART without any reflection or articulation on ESD. In this situation Chairs of CART have been required to place a condition that the course will not be permitted to run until the ESD requirement is satisfied (see section 2 for the 3 key questions to be addressed by CART). It is expected that in the second year of CART that greater familiarity with and embedding of ESD at School level will reduce the number of instances where ESD has not been addressed and a course has been rejected.

f) Discussions with Schools and CART members over the year have revealed some instances of the misunderstandings and differences of interpretation of the ESD requirements that can occur. To clarify:

- The articulation of ESD relates to a **Course or Programme level** articulation. The course needs to demonstrate *where* and *how* within the programme stages the teaching, learning and assessment of sustainable development are located and communicated to the student.
- This does **not** require every module to include lectures on sustainable development. Nor does it require a course to include aspects of sustainable development that would be meaningless or irrelevant to the subject and therefore to the students (see b above).

- Crucially, the judgement about the extent of coverage and the type of coverage **lies with the course team** and not with CART.

g) A year since the introduction of the ESD requirement as part of new course approval and Periodic Review has generated a diverse range of views, outcomes and impacts. The framework developed for implementing ESD was designed to be as flexible as possible to allow Schools to construct and interpret their own articulation: different Schools have approached the embedding of ESD in different ways in accordance to specific subjects and disciplines, as well as School approaches to teaching and learning. School dynamics, attitudes to CART *per se* and the way in which 'centre-to-School' initiatives are viewed can also impact on how the CART process unfolds.